

## **SHERLOCK HOLMES AS A CSI**

Susan Singer, St. Aloysius Elementary School, Pewee Valley, Kentucky.  
Beacon Society Jan Stauber Grant winner, 2010

This unit was designed to expose 8<sup>th</sup> grade students to a master of mystery: Sherlock Holmes and the author, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle. Holmes was a detective created by Doyle who was superhuman in his keen powers of observation. He took a dogmatic methodological approach in his calculations. He was able to analyze clues and use his intuition to gather evidence. He had a factual and unemotional and disciplined manner of solving mysteries. The Crime Scene Investigator of today works in the same way as Sherlock Holmes with added use of forensic science with *Hound of the Baskervilles*. Also this unit would have the students use their critical thinking skills to solve the mystery/crime.

### **INTRODUCTION TO UNIT:**

Students will be given a whodunit story to solve. They will be given a sheet on "Analytical Reasoning" that will help them in their investigation. They will discuss in groups the clues, evidence and possibilities of who had committed this crime. Each group will discuss their case and give their resolution to the case.

The class will then chart a list of famous detectives and compare them with detectives in movies or on television. They will also discuss: "What technological advances do detectives today have that Holmes might not have had? What methods are used today to solve crimes?" Begin the discussion of forensic science and CSI. Discuss how Sherlock Holmes actually was the first forensic detective of this time.

### **Introduction of the *Hound of the Baskervilles*:**

Objective: Students will demonstrate their comprehension by describing and discussing the elements of the book.

Students will compare and contrast texts, inferring theme and meaning.

Students will respond to text in critical and creative ways.

Students will identify and analyze how an author uses figurative language, sound devices and literary techniques to shape plot, set meaning and develop tone.

Students will practice observational and deductive thinking skills.

#### 5W's of the *Hound of the Baskervilles*

Who: Sherlock Holmes, Dr. Watson, Sir Henry Baskerville

Where: Baskerville Hall, England

When: late 1800's

What: killing in the moors

Why: Supernatural or real?

Students will be asked to keep an observation notebook while reading. They will note all clues and the explanation of each clue. Characterizations will be written about each major character. Students will also have a section for foreshadowing, flashbacks and suspense. Discussion will occur to explain the time period and the use of the supernatural to set the mood.

### LITERATURE CIRCLES:

Students will be divided into groups of six, who will take on the roles of discussion director, literary luminary, story element sleuth, summarizer, illustrator, and connector. Students will read 3 chapters each night and discuss the chapters as well as rotate the jobs each day with each member.

At the end of each week the groups will come together to share their insight on plot, characters, theme, symbols and motifs of the story. The book should be completed in three weeks.

### PROJECTS: (can be used during the reading of the novel)

1. The students will use the CSI board game to investigate a crime scene. Through this game they will understand the role of each investigator as well as the technology used to test the evidence. They will also use the CSI fingerprint analysis kit to actually examine evidence. They will compare and contrast the methods used by Sherlock Holmes in the novel.
2. The students will use "Bella's Mystery Deck" to solve the mystery by using their critical thinking skills. They will use these same methods while reading the novel.
3. Students will play the CLUE game to understand how clues, critical thinking skills, and prior knowledge are used to solve a mystery.
4. They will compare and contrast how the clues were/are given in the novel.

### CULMINATING ACTIVITY:

Students will work in small groups of 3 and use "How to Write a Crime Story" (teacher-created activity) to create an actual crime story to be solved by the other groups. They will provide the 5Ws for the story and provide all of the elements in the story. The stories can be read aloud and even dramatized for the class.

### How to Use Analytical Reasoning

1. Become a masterful observer of minutiae.
2. When presented with a mystery, minutiae are the small facts upon which large inferences often depend.
3. Develop a set of possible causes for the facts you have observed.
4. Eliminate the least likely causes: resist the urge to “guess” and instead use Occam's Razor, a principle asserting that the simplest explanations are most often correct.
5. Synthesize your inferences into a story that explains the facts.

### HOW TO WRITE A CRIME STORY

Every crime story is different and attracts a different kind of reader. In some crime stories, the thrill is in trying to anticipate all the twists and turns before the author reveals the solution. In other crime stories, the reader spends the book anxiously wondering whether the detective will catch the criminal before another grisly murder. Write the sort of crime story that you would find thrilling and exciting to read.

1. Decide on what sort of crime story you are going to write. A crime story can be a "whodunit," in which the reader doesn't know who the guilty party is, or a "howcatchem" story where the audience knows from the beginning. In a whodunit, the reader tries to figure out the mystery before the detective can. In a howcatchem, the reader watches the detective unravel the mystery.
2. Create a setting. A detective story can take place pretty much anywhere. In a locked room story, all the action takes place in a closed space where the crime has been committed. On the other extreme, an international thriller can take place all over the world.
3. Create the protagonist or protagonists. A crime novel hero can be a hard-boiled police officer, a seasoned and world-weary detective, a brilliant amateur who is called on to unravel the crime before the villain strikes again or anyone else you can think of. Decide on the tactics she uses to solve the crime, her back story, how she talks and looks and what motivates her. Be sure to include some flaws. Flawless heroes are usually a bit boring.

4. Create a villain. A villain can be a diabolical madman, a ruthless profiteer, a misguided idealist or a victim bent on revenge over some past wrong. He can have a sinister, diabolical appearance or look utterly harmless. He can be someone the reader will despise or someone he will identify with and feel sorry for. The villain and his crime set the emotional tone of the book.
  
5. Create a crime. Brutal and creative murders are classic, but a crime novel can revolve around simpler, less sinister acts. For example, the story "Who Stole the Wizard of Oz" by Avi is a whodunit for children that revolves around the theft of a single book from the library. Because the story is not about a gruesome crime, kids can have a chance to enjoy the thrills of a crime novel.
  
6. Create a trail of clues. As the story goes on, the protagonist should discover more clues about the crime. Use physical evidence from the crime scene, research the detective does and interviews with various people to provide different types of clues. For example, if the novel is about a murderer, blood from the crime scene, criminal profiling by detectives and interviews with the families of the perpetrator and the victim can all be clues. False clues can also be used to lead the detective away from the right answer and build tension.
  
7. Create a satisfying ending. Some detective stories gradually, broodingly build toward a tense finish. Others surprise you with a sudden twist and an unexpected solution to the mystery. The ending you choose determines how the reader remembers the book and what she takes away from it.

## HOUND OF THE BASKERVILLES

### QUESTIONS FOR STUDENTS

#### CHAPTERS 1-5

1. Where are Holmes and Watson at the beginning of the novel?
2. What information is revealed by the mysterious walking stick and what character does it belong to?
3. What evidence is found near the body of Sir Charles?
4. How is Sir Henry related to Sir Charles Baskerville?
5. What mysterious things happen to Sir Henry upon his arrival in London?
6. What does Sherlock Holmes deduce from the anonymous letter sent to Sir Henry Baskerville? How does he make these deductions?
7. What is the curse on the Baskerville family? According to the legend, how did it begin?
8. What name does the man in the cab give to the driver? How does Holmes react?
9. There are two settings in this novel. One is where the action so far takes place; the other is described in the manuscript. Describe both settings, in terms of time and place.
10. What is Sherlock Holmes like? Consider how he approaches evidence, the questions he asks, how he treats Watson, and his ECCENTRICITIES. Make a list of the six best words to describe Holmes.
11. What likely motive exists for Sir Charles' death and the intimidation of Sir Henry? Which suspects appear to have been cleared?
12. Sir Henry says, "You don't quite seem to have made up your mind whether it's a case for a policeman or a clergyman." Explain this statement. Do you think the evidence points to a logical or a supernatural explanation at this point?
13. How does the author use the first few chapters of the novel to establish the theme that most people are unobservant and tend not to see the obvious?

## CHAPTERS 6-10

1. Why are there guards at the train station and along the road?
2. What noise does Watson hear during his first night at Baskerville Hall?
3. Who are the Stapletons and Mr. Frankland?
4. Who are the Barrymores?
5. What have the Barrymores found in Sir Charles' fireplace?
6. How does Stapleton explain his odd behavior when he finds Sir Henry and his sister together on the moor?
7. In what way does the setting of Baskerville Hall on the moor contribute to the mood of the novel? List as 6 words or more that the author uses to describe the moor and explain each one's effect.
8. Briefly describe the subplot, which involves the Barrymores and the escaped convict Selden.
9. In what way does the developing relationship between Miss Stapleton and Sir Henry complicate the plot?

## CHAPTERS 11-15

1. Why did Laura Lyons write a letter to Sir Charles Baskerville?
2. How does Holmes know that Watson is in his hut?
3. What interrupts Holmes as he is telling Watson about the murderer?
4. Where does Mrs. Stapleton tell Holmes and Watson to look for Stapleton?
5. Who or what is the hound of Baskervilles?
6. List the elements of Holmes' plan to catch the murderer.
7. Do you like Beryl Stapleton as a character? Why or why not?
8. The mystery is solved in Chapter 14. What purpose, therefore, does Chapter 15 serve?

9. Who is the mysterious man seen by Watson on the TOR? Who discovers the man's identity? How? Where has he been hiding?
10. Who is killed by falling from a cliff on the moor? At first, who do Holmes and Watson think it is? Why?
11. Why does Sherlock Holmes go to the moor in secret? What advantage does this give him?
12. How does Holmes discover that Jack and Beryl Stapleton are not brother and sister? What is their relationship?
13. Why is Holmes fascinated by the portrait of Hugo Baskerville? What missing piece of the puzzle does the portrait reveal?
14. Why do you think the author did not choose to have Holmes use a decoy instead of Sir Henry in the trap to catch Stapleton? If you were Sir Henry, would you have agreed to Holmes' plan? Why or why not?
15. One theme of the novel is that strong emotion can lead one to do things for the wrong reasons. How does Stapleton use that idea to further his ends?
16. What effect does the author achieve by using Dr. Watson as a first person narrator?
17. A **foil** is a character that serves as a striking contrast for another character. How do both Watson and Stapleton serve as **foils** for Holmes?
18. Explain how the theme **GREED CORRUPTS** is presented in the novel.
19. Explain how the theme **FEAR AND SUPERSTITION OFTEN OBSCURE THE TRUTH** is revealed in the novel.
20. Explain 3 conflicts in the novel.
21. Holmes assumes Stapleton perished in Grimpen Mire, but there is no evidence to support that assumption. Write an ending from Stapleton's point of view, one in which he escapes to bother Sherlock at another time in the future.
22. Decide on the 10 most important events in the book and put them in the order they occurred in the novel.

## HOUND OF THE BASKERVILLES QUIZ (3 pages)

1. How is Stapleton related to Sir Henry Baskerville?
  - a. He is his neighbor and friend
  - b. He is his brother-in-law
  - c. He is his long lost son
  - d. He is his cousin, Uncle Roger's long lost son and twice removed heir to the Baskerville fortune
2. Why does Stapleton pretend his wife is his sister?
  - a. They are actually related
  - b. He needs to pretend he is single in order to inherit the Baskerville fortune
  - c. He needs to pretend he is single in order to convince Laura Lyons and Sir Henry that he and his wife are free agents
  - d. He is no longer in love with his wife
3. Why does Sir Henry lose two boots in London?
  - a. The hotel staff conspires against him
  - b. The hotel staff steals expensive footwear
  - c. Mrs. Stapleton wanted to tip Henry off to her husband's scheme
  - d. Stapleton needed the scent from an old boot to lure his hound
4. Who established the Baskerville curse?
  - a. Sir Hugo Baskerville
  - b. Sir Charles Baskerville
  - c. Sir Henry Baskerville
  - d. Stapleton
5. Who took advantage of the Baskerville curse?
  - a. Sir Hugo Baskerville
  - b. Sir Charles Baskerville
  - c. Sir Henry Baskerville
  - d. Stapleton
6. What substance does Stapleton use to make his hound look scary?
  - a. Blood
  - b. Glow sticks
  - c. CO2 cartridges
  - d. Phosphorous
7. What role does the escaped convict play in Stapleton's scheme?
  - a. He helps Stapleton keep tabs on Henry and Watson with Barrymore's assistance
  - b. He dies at Stapleton's dog's hands but otherwise does nothing
  - c. He helps Watson locate the mysterious stranger on the moor, complicating Stapleton's plans
  - d. He brings food to Holmes



8. What happens to Henry at the end of the story?
  - a. He goes on a trip with Mortimer to calm his nerves
  - b. He marries the now widowed Mrs. Stapleton
  - c. He stuffs the hound and hangs it on his wall
  - d. He stays at Baskerville Hall to continue his uncle's good works
9. How did Sir Charles die?
  - a. Eaten by the hound
  - b. Attacked by the hound
  - c. Scared by the hound
  - d. Shot by the hound
10. With whom does Stapleton share an eerie resemblance?
  - a. Sir Henry Baskerville
  - b. The woman who is supposed to be his wife, suggesting they are brother and sister
  - c. Hugo Baskerville
  - d. Sir Henry
11. Why does the hound kill the escaped convict?
  - a. Because he smelled bad
  - b. Because he was wearing Sir Henry's suit
  - c. It was a trial run
  - d. Because he attacked Stapleton
12. Why does Laura Lyons refuse to tell anyone why she missed her late-night appointment with Sir Charles?
  - a. Because she killed him, dressing up like a massive hound and scaring him to death
  - b. Because she is protecting Stapleton, whom she thinks is in love with her
  - c. Because she is afraid of a public scandal
  - d. Because she did not miss her late-night appointment
13. Who let the dogs out?
  - a. Stapleton
  - b. Sherlock Holmes
  - c. Mrs. Stapleton
  - d. Mortimer
14. Why wasn't Mrs. Stapleton at dinner on the night Sir Henry was attacked?
  - a. Stapleton killed her
  - b. Stapleton beat her and tied her up upstairs
  - c. She had gone out to run some errands
  - d. She got sucked up by the Grimpen mire

15. Where does Holmes send Cartwright in search of the cut up newspaper?
  - a. A newspaper stand
  - b. The garbage
  - c. The printer's
  - d. Devonshire
16. When is the only time in the book that Holmes is proven wrong?
  - a. When Mortimer arrives and reveals he left the city when he got married
  - b. When he predicts that Stapleton is in fact a woman
  - c. When he claims that the convict was in league with Stapleton
  - d. When he assumes that the hound is otherworldly
17. Who is Frankland?
  - a. The Hound of the Baskervilles
  - b. Laura's father
  - c. The true heir to the Baskerville fortune
  - d. Stapleton's accomplice
18. Why is Mrs. Barrymore crying?
  - a. Because her brother, the escaped convict, is hiding out on the moor
  - b. Because her husband is abusive
  - c. Because her husband is having an affair
  - d. Because Watson refuses her sexual overtures
19. Why do the Barrymores really want to leave Baskerville Hall?
  - a. Because they assume Sir Henry will need a larger staff
  - b. Because they figure Watson can take care of all of Sir Henry's needs
  - c. Because they were scared and saddened at the death of Sir Charles
  - d. Because they want to go to South America with their brother, the convict

FINAL EXAMINATION (3 pages)

**MULTIPLE CHOICE QUIZ**

**1. Holmes and Watson are incorrect in this deduction from their visitor's cane:**

- a. his occupation
- b. the reason he was given it
- c. where he works now
- d. where he used to work

**2. This person discovered and reported the death of Sir Charles Baskerville:**

- a. Barrymore
- b. Dr. Mortimer
- c. Mrs. Barrymore
- d. Stapleton

**3. The member of the Baskerville line that fled to [Error! Hyperlink reference not valid.](#) was:**

- a. Hugo
- b. Charles
- c. Rodger
- d. Henry

**4. The letters of the note warning Sir Henry were cut from this newspaper:**

- a. unknown
- b. Post
- c. Times
- d. Devon County Chronicle

**5. The cabman reported to Holmes that his passenger's name was:**

- a. Barrymore
- b. Sherlock Holmes
- c. Stapleton
- d. Hugo

**6. Watson hears this sound while he is trying to sleep on his first night in Baskerville Hall:**

- a. low music
- b. footsteps
- c. a man's voice
- d. a woman crying

**7. When pressed, Error! Hyperlink reference not valid. says he believes the sound on the moor is this:**

- a. the hound of the Baskervilles
- b. a horse stuck in the marshy ground
- c. Selden, the criminal
- d. the last of the bitterns

**8. Sir Henry does this after Barrymore seems upset at his questioning over the telegram:**

- a. gives him a raise
- b. questions him further over the reason for his uneasiness
- c. tells him he can just leave if he is so unhappy
- d. gave him some old clothes

**9. Stapleton gives this reason for his outburst at the romance between Sir Henry and Miss Stapleton:**

- a. he did not want to lose his only companion
- b. he did not like Sir Henry
- c. he did not want his sister around a man with a family curse
- d. she was his **Error! Hyperlink reference not valid.**

**10. Watson believes Laura Lyons has information on the case because:**

- a. she told him she did
- b. Barrymore said she had come around a few times in the days before Sir Charles's death
- c. he sees a woman's footprint near the spot where Sir Charles died
- d. her initials were at the bottom of a partially-burned letter

**11. Why does Frankland not report his sighting of the boy carrying food across the moor?**

- a. he sympathizes with the convict
- b. he plans on making a case of it later, claiming that he could not report it since it would be a violation of privacy to report on others' activities
- c. he feels the authorities have not done enough to stop the protests against him
- d. the authorities will no longer listen to him

**12. The hound accidentally went after Selden because:**

- a. he was a similar size and shape to Sir Henry
- b. he was wearing clothes that smelled like Sir Henry

- c. he was closer than Sir Henry, and so caught his scent first
- d. Selden had let the hound loose

**13. This is Holmes's final clue that leads him to the motive behind the crime:**

- a. Hugo's portrait
- b. Sir Charles's will
- c. Rodger's portrait
- d. Laura Lyon's letter

**14. This was what made the hound look fierce and supernatural:**

- a. neon
- b. phosphorus
- c. potassium
- d. argon

**15. This was Stapleton's name and formal career immediately before coming to the moor:**

- a. Vandeleur, embezzlement
- b. Vandeleur, ran school
- c. Fraser, ran school
- d. Baskerville, entomology

**16. Sir Henry's fate was:**

- a. he is recovering by **Error! Hyperlink reference not valid.**
- b. the hound caused permanent injury to his throat and he died three days later
- c. in his fright at seeing the hound, he ran into Grimpen Mire and is presumed dead
- d. he decided to leave most of his fortune to the Barrymores and return to **Error! Hyperlink reference not valid.**

**17. Pick 3 major symbols and analyze their use and meaning throughout the novel. (30 pts)**

**18. What is the role of the location in the novel — in setting the mood, enabling events, as a contrast between urban London and rural Devonshire? (25 pts)**

## CSI/Mystery Bibliography

Doyle, Sir Arthur Conan. Hounds of the Baskervilles. New York: Penguin Group Inc., 2001. ISBN: 71149-00495-2.

Conrad, Hy. Whodunit Crime Mysteries. New York: Sterling Publishing Co., Inc., 2003. ISBN: 1-4027-0646-4.

Hockett, M.A.. Red Herrings Science Mysteries. Pacific Grove, CA: Critical Thinking Books & Software, 1996. ISBN: 0-89455-653-3.

Hoomes, Eleanor W. PhD.. Create -A-Sleuth: Writing A Detective Story. Hawthorne, New Jersey, 1993. ISBN: 0-910857-01-6.

Riggs, Ransom. The Sherlock Holmes Handbook. San Francisco, CA: Chronicle Books, 2009. ISBN: 978-1-59474-429-7.

Schimmel, David. Sherlock Holmes Activity Book. Mineola, NY: dover Publications, Inc., 2009. ISBN: 978-0-486-47480-9.

Schulz, Karen K. Crime Scene Detective: Theft. Waco, TX: Prufrock Press Inc., 2008. ISBN: 978-1-59363-293-9.

Schulz, Karen K. Forensic Science for Kids: CSI Expert. Waco, TX: Prufrock Press, Inc., 2008. ISBN: 978-1-59363-312-7.

Smith, Stan. Five-Minute Crimebusters. New York: Sterling Publishing Co., Inc., 2000. ISBN: 978-0-8069-1827-3.

Wiese, Jim. Detective Science. San Francisco, CA: A Wiley Imprint, 1996. ISBN: 978-0-471-11980-7.

### **Activities:**

CLUE: Discover the Secrets. Pawtucket, RI: Harbro; Parker Brothers, 2008.

CSI: Crime Scene Investigation Board Game. Barrie, Ontario, 2004.

Bella's Mystery Deck. Roseville, MN: MindWare, 1997.

CSI: Crime Scene Investigation. Fingerprint Analysis Kit. China: EDU Science, 2010.

### **Websites:**

[www.BeaconSociety.com](http://www.BeaconSociety.com)

[www.teachingsherlockholmes.com](http://www.teachingsherlockholmes.com)

[www.crime-scene-investigator.net](http://www.crime-scene-investigator.net)

[www.bookrags.com/lessonplan/hound-of-the-baskervilles/intro.html](http://www.bookrags.com/lessonplan/hound-of-the-baskervilles/intro.html)

### **Video:**

The Hound of the Baskervilles. DVD. 80 minutes. ISBN: 0-7886-0518-6.